

**Minutes of the Regular Meeting
of the Massachusetts Board of Elementary and Secondary Education
Tuesday, May 22, 2018
10:30 a.m. – 2:10 p.m.
Marblehead High School, 2 Humphrey Street, Marblehead, MA**

Members of the Board of Elementary and Secondary Education Present:

Paul Sagan, Chair, Cambridge
James Morton, Vice-Chair, Boston
Katherine Craven, Brookline
Ed Doherty, Boston
Amanda Fernandez, Belmont
Margaret McKenna, Boston
Michael Moriarty, Holyoke
James Peyser, Secretary of Education
Mary Ann Stewart, Lexington
Hannah Trimarchi, Chair, Student Advisory Council, Marblehead

Jeffrey C. Riley, Commissioner of Elementary and Secondary Education

Member of the Board of Elementary and Secondary Education Absent:

Martin West, Newton

Chair Sagan convened the meeting at 10:30 a.m. The members of the Board of Elementary and Secondary Education (Board) introduced themselves. Chair Sagan said it was a pleasure to be at Ms. Trimarchi's school. He commented on the Board's special meeting on Monday, May 14, 2018, which was a presentation and discussion on the Massachusetts Next-Generation Accountability and Assistance System and the Turnaround Assistance Redesign. He added that at the June meeting, the Board is expected to vote on the new accountability system. Chair Sagan thanked Vice-Chair Morton for chairing the April meeting and noted that Mr. Morton recently received an honorary degree from Salem State University and gave the commencement address for the College of Arts and Sciences.

Commissioner Riley informed the Board that Jamil Siddiqui, a math teacher at East Bridgewater Junior/Senior High School, has been named the 2019 Massachusetts Teacher of the Year. He noted that 15 of Mr. Siddiqui's former students are now math teachers. Commissioner Riley commented on his school visits over the past month and said he wants to continue celebrating great teachers and schools. He echoed Chair Sagan's comments about the special meeting on the accountability system and thanked the Board for their thoughtful discussion. The Commissioner said he wants to tread cautiously and look at this after a year to see if there are any unintended consequences as well as pluses to the system. Commissioner Riley acknowledged the tragic death of Stoughton High School students in a car crash a few days ago. He said he reached out to the school and district to offer condolences and support on behalf of the Board and the Department.

Statements from the Public

1. **Matthew Spengler**, Founder and Executive Director of Blueprint Schools Network, addressed the Board on Level 5 Schools: Update from Dever School, Boston
2. **George "Scott" Guild**, Massachusetts Council on Economic Education President, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
3. **David Floreen**, MassSaves Steering Committee Member, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
4. **Rob Powers**, K-12 Social Studies Coordinator, Plymouth Public Schools, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
5. **Gorman Lee**, Massachusetts Council for the Social Studies, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
6. **Natacha Scott**, Boston Public Schools, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
7. **Chris Martell**, Boston University, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
8. **Arielle Jennings**, Generation Citizen, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
9. **Claudia Wu**, Newton North High School Center for Civic Engagement and Service, addressed the Board on Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework
10. **Dee Kanejiya**, Founder & CEO of Cognii, addressed the Board on Preliminary Information on Automated Test Scoring

Approval of Minutes

On a motion duly made and seconded, it was:

VOTED: that the Board of Elementary and Secondary Education approves the minutes of April 24, 2018 Regular Meeting.

The vote was unanimous.

Welcome from Marblehead High School

Chair Sagan introduced Maryann Perry, Superintendent of the Marblehead Public Schools, and Daniel Bauer, Principal of Marblehead High School, and thanked them for hosting the meeting. Superintendent Perry welcomed the Board on behalf of the schools and school committee. She provided a brief history of her tenure in the position over the last six years and said how proud she is of Ms. Trimarchi. Principal Bauer welcomed the Board and thanked all the people behind the scenes for helping make this meeting happen. He spoke about Ms. Trimarchi and highlighted her academic and extra-curricular activities. Principal Bauer noted the attendance of State Representative Lori Ehrlich at the meeting.

Chair Sagan lauded Ms. Trimarchi as an exemplary member of the Board who has taken this responsibility seriously. The Board applauded Ms. Trimarchi and thanked her for her service.

Representative Ehrlich welcomed the Board to Marblehead, acknowledged the Board's dedication, thanked the Board for its work on the History and Social Science framework, and honored Ms. Trimarchi as the pride of the town and an example for students and adults to follow. Representative Ehrlich wished Ms. Trimarchi much success at George Washington University, and said the nation needs her and her peers to stay deeply engaged.

New Mission High School, Boston (Title I Distinguished School)

Commissioner Riley introduced Tommy Chang, Superintendent of the Boston Public Schools. Superintendent Chang introduced Naia Wilson, Principal of New Mission High School in Boston, to speak about the work she has been leading at the school for the past 12 years. Principal Wilson provided a brief history of the school, which was founded in 1998 and is one of 21 pilot schools in the Boston Public School system. She stated the school's mission is based on social justice and preparing students to become college graduates. Principal Wilson said the school aims to be an "exam school without the exam."

Principal Wilson described the demographics of the student body and presented data on MCAS performance and graduation rates. She discussed key levers in changing the school and the life trajectories of her students, including: a culture of achievement and college success; equity and access to advanced coursework; academic and social emotional supports; distributed leadership – shared decision-making; collaborative teacher-led teams; and autonomy. She described the accelerated pathways for students in math, science, English language arts, history, and computer science. Principal Wilson said the school enhances academics through a number of programs and community partnerships. She added that New Mission is portfolio-based and students demonstrate their learning through presentations to their families and advisors, answering essential questions in all four core content classes and reflecting on their goals for continued success. She said student portfolios and presentations are an excellent family engagement tool. In closing, Principal Wilson discussed the special programs, clubs, and afterschool programs her students participate in and thanked the Board for inviting her to talk about her school.

Ms. McKenna asked about capacity issues when the school adds seventh and eighth graders. Superintendent Chang said while there are challenges, the expansion will make New Mission the first non-exam school serving grades 7-12. Vice-Chair Morton commended Principal Wilson for her work and said he appreciates the way she is creating a conversation about equity and access so students can learn how to overcome challenges and see great results. Chair Sagan thanked Principal Wilson for her presentation.

Level 5 Schools: Update from Dever School, Boston, by Superintendent Tommy Chang

Russell Johnston, Senior Associate Commissioner, said on his recent visit to the Dever School he was encouraged to see the school's continued improvement. Christine Landry, Boston Public Schools Instructional Superintendent, Dr. Todd Fishburn, Principal, and Superintendent Tommy Chang introduced themselves to the Board.

Dr. Fishburn said the Dever Elementary School is aggressively working on making its turnaround a reality. He said the turnaround plan boils down to rigor, relationships, and

reflection. Dr. Fishburn responded to questions from Mr. Moriarty about how the school is responding to the high student turnover and chronic absenteeism in 2017. He said attendance has improved and there are intervention plans for students who have been chronically absent from school.

Superintendent Chang thanked the late Commissioner Mitchell Chester for the confidence he had in asking the superintendent to manage the Dever as receiver. Superintendent Chang discussed the commitment to consistent leadership, the alignment of instruction with the Boston Public Schools essentials for instructional equity, increased focus on culturally and linguistically sustaining practices, and increased external partnerships.

Ms. Landry discussed the four priority areas that the school's turnaround plan identifies as levers of change: a strong focus on great teaching, a program of study that provides students with a well-rounded curriculum, supports for students so they have what they need to learn, and effective use of resources, including time, funds, staff, operational support, and other resources. Ms. Landry and Principal Fishburn provided examples of how they are working to accomplish these priorities. Dr. Fishburn closed by discussing the priorities for the 2018-2019 school year, including working on restorative practices and strengthening communication with families.

Chair Sagan acknowledged the collaboration between the Department and the district and thanked the superintendent for embracing the challenge to turn around the school.

Chair Sagan called for a break at 12:20 p.m. The Board reconvened at 12:30 p.m.

Draft Revised History and Social Science Curriculum Framework

Chair Sagan said the Department and Board have been working on and discussing the revised History and Social Science framework for quite a while and are close to the finish line. Heather Peske, Senior Associate Commissioner, introduced David Buchanan, Consultant, and Susan Wheltle, Consultant, and credited them as the architects behind this good work. Ms. Peske explained that the goal today is to present proposed changes to the framework in response to public comment and other input and to get the Board's input by May 31, in preparation for a vote on the final framework in June. Ms. Peske reviewed the background and timeline of the history and social science review. She thanked the members of the History and Social Science review panel who worked with the Department for the past two years.

Mr. Buchanan acknowledged the work of the 21 content advisors and reviewed the priorities and criteria that have guided their work. Mr. Buchanan said the framework has benefited from a robust public comment period since January 23 when the Board voted to invite comment on the draft. He said the process included web conferences, conference calls, in-person presentations, and the public survey. Ms. Peske reviewed some of the key themes from the public comment – including assessment, the amount of content, and high school courses – and how the Department responded. Ms. Wheltle outlined additional themes such as the representation of the diversity of America and world history. Ms. Stewart asked how the team has addressed LGBTQ history. Ms. Wheltle explained it is now in the standards.

Ms. Whelple said the State Student Advisory Council provided valuable insight in a number of areas. She and Mr. Buchanan reviewed additional changes made in response to public comment, including news/media literacy.

Ms. Peske discussed the plans for next steps after what they hope is the adoption of the framework. She introduced Michelle Ryan, the Department's history and social science specialist, and noted the Department is planning a civic education institute in July. In response to a question from Ms. Fernandez, Ms. Peske said cultural proficiency would be embedded in the civics institute. Ms. Fernandez suggested including the Westminster case as well as Brown v. Board of Education. Chair Sagan asked about plans for assessment. Secretary Peyser said the Governor's FY19 budget and the House budget could move this forward and we need to get the process going before we can provide a meaningful schedule. Ms. Peske said the Department will review assessment options, including alternative types of assessments, and will provide updates on this topic and opportunities for the field to be involved as the planning proceeds. Mr. Moriarty cautioned against an assessment that relies solely on portfolios or service projects.

Commissioner Riley said he is grateful to the Department staff and the review panel and outside experts for all their work. He added that he is interested in considering alternative types of assessments, and funding needs to be worked out on Beacon Hill. Secretary Peyser said the revised framework is high quality, the content is solid, it is faithful to the existing framework but takes it to a new level and that is tremendously important. He added that it broadens the lens of the existing framework to include previously underrepresented groups and individuals. Secretary Peyser said the revised framework encourages deeper and more analytical engagement with the content, and the grade 8 civics course is a significant and important shift. He said he is looking forward to adoption of the framework next month.

Preliminary Information on Automated Test Scoring

Commissioner Riley said he is interested in the idea of shrinking testing time, perhaps through computer adaptive testing or artificial intelligence scoring or both, to serve schools and students better and use more time for instructional purposes. He added that today's topic is the Department's initial exploration of artificial intelligence and automated test scoring. The Commissioner said we are at the very beginning stages and it is important to explore the options. Chair Sagan said this topic has come up several times and one of the goals would be efficiency to return test results more quickly so they are more useful to schools, teachers, and families.

Jeff Wulfson, Deputy Commissioner, introduced Michol Stapel, Associate Commissioner for Student Assessment, and Bob Lee, Chief Analyst. Mr. Wulfson said this is the first of what we expect will be many discussions with the Board and the field. He noted the Department first explored this idea several years ago when we were beginning our engagement with the PARCC consortium, and there have been huge advances in artificial intelligence over the last few years.

Ms. Stapel presented an overview of the current English Language Arts (ELA) MCAS scoring and explained that approximately 1.5 million ELA essays will be scored by hundreds of trained scorers in spring 2018 at scoring centers in eight states. Ms. Stapel reviewed the minimum requirements scorers must meet and the training scorers receive. She then explained how the

ELA essays are scored using rubrics for two “traits”: idea development and conventions. Ms. Stapel discussed scorer reliability and then walked the Board through an automated scoring process and the process if an essay is flagged. She explained pilot research on one MCAS grade 5 ELA essay from 2017. Ms. Stapel said many states are doing some type of automated scoring and we can learn from their experience. She said the next steps would include reaching out to stakeholder groups, proponents, and skeptics to hear their views.

Ms. McKenna asked if our current method of scoring the essays is the reason MCAS scoring takes as long as it does. Mr. Wulfson said it is. Ms. Craven asked how much the Commonwealth spends now to grade these 1.5 million essays. Mr. Wulfson said the cost is built into the larger Measured Progress contract but it would be approximately \$4 million. Ms. Fernandez said she knows we are in an exploratory phase and asked if there is a timeline in terms of analysis and possible recommendations. Mr. Wulfson said the Department will work on this project as time and resources allow. Commissioner Riley said he is interested in learning more and we can take the time we need to explore the possibility. Chair Sagan encouraged the Commissioner to continue discussing this with the Board when ready. He said the technology is moving forward in great leaps and it may be able to deliver results sooner, fairer, and better than the current scoring method.

State Student Advisory Council End-of-Year Report for 2017-2018

Chair Sagan invited Ms. Trimarchi, the Board’s student representative and Chairwoman of the State Student Advisory Council (SSAC), to present the SSAC’s annual report. Ms. Trimarchi thanked the Board and the SSAC for their work over the course of the year. She also thanked those who spoke on her behalf this morning. Ms. Trimarchi presented background on the SSAC and explained the organization of the regional and state councils. She said the students represent every part of the state; they are peer-elected and meet every two months. She said the SSAC, which was created in statute in 1971, has been active in state education policy and legislation.

Ms. Trimarchi provided examples of the work of the regional councils this year including working groups focused on environmental sustainability and career and college readiness. She highlighted the work of the SSAC, including providing input on the History and Social Science Curriculum Framework. Ms. Trimarchi noted the SSAC civic education and engagement working group participated in the Malden High School walkout this spring, which resulted in insightful discussions that bridged the gap between adults and students. Ms. Trimarchi expressed her optimism about the future of the SSAC and her pride in what the students have accomplished. In closing, she discussed the work she is doing with former regional and state Student Advisory Council members to create an Alumni Student Advisory Council. Chair Sagan thanked Ms. Trimarchi for her presentation and said the Board is impressed with all the work the students have done.

Update on FY 2019 State Education Budget

Bill Bell, Senior Associate Commissioner/CFO, updated the Board on the state education budget. He said for the current FY18, the House and Senate passed a supplemental budget that includes additional funding for the circuit breaker program and for district reimbursement for charter

school tuition payments. He reminded the Board that earlier this year, the Legislature provided relief funding for districts that have enrolled displaced students from Puerto Rico and the U.S. Virgin Islands. He added that the Department distributed the first round of funds in April and will distribute round two to districts soon.

Mr. Bell said the federal budget also included an emergency impact aid program for districts that have enrolled students from Puerto Rico, the U.S. Virgin Islands, and any students who were affected by Hurricane Harvey and the California wildfires. He said districts are able to apply and we have an ongoing process to collect data from the districts and have those districts reimbursed by the federal government. He added that the Department will file an application for that funding by June 4 and is finalizing data collection with the districts.

With respect to the FY19 budget, Mr. Bell said the Senate budget debate is going on now. He said the theme of the Senate budget is similar to the Governor's and the House budget, with a strong commitment to education and local aid accounts. The budget then goes to the conference committee to settle the final numbers. Mr. Bell said we expect the final budget will support the Governor's initiative to move oversight and administration of the five recovery high schools from the Department of Public Health (DPH) to the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education. He said we are working with the Executive Office of Education and DPH on transition of the program.

Proposed Schedule for Regular Board Meetings through June 2019

Chair Sagan called the members' attention to the proposed schedule for Board meetings in FY2019. He said Board members should contact Helene Bettencourt, Chief of Staff, with any feedback, and the Board will vote on the calendar at the next meeting.

On a motion duly made and seconded, it was:

VOTED: that the Board of Elementary and Secondary Education adjourn the meeting at 2:10 p.m., subject to the call of the Chair.

The vote was unanimous.

Respectfully submitted,
Jeffrey C. Riley
Commissioner of Elementary and Secondary Education
and Secretary to the Board